

Reconsidering the Role of African Children in Renaissance Pictography

ONYEKA NUBIA

University of Nottingham

ABSTRACT The African is a ‘careless interloper,’ ‘stranger,’ ‘foreigner,’ an ‘unexpected and unwelcome guest’ in European Renaissance art. And the presence of African children in that art is an indication of slavery, cultural, social, political and economic exploitation. Hitherto these notions have been the dominant historiographical positions, used to define African children in European pictography; and excavate the presence, status and origins of those ‘kinds of people’ in early modern societies. But now, a more nuanced and intersectional position is being adopted, that is not revisionist but reformative of Renaissance pictography and early modern ethnicity. This presentation will explore these complicated matters.

The Renaissance is etched into popular consciousness by classical pictography such as the *Mona Lisa* by Leonardo Da Vinci, Sandro Botticelli’s *The Birth of Venus* and Michelangelo’s frescos of the Sistine Chapel. Of course, these works offer eclectically different and conflicting artistic notions of Europe’s ‘rebirth’ (1485–1660),¹ but these differences can be commodified into a series of consistent emotional narratives that claim a European cultural aesthetic. An aesthetic which asserts ‘Europe looked like this’: adult, Christian, beautiful, holy and white. These notions influence scholarship which focuses on an intellectual appreciation of ‘early,’ ‘high,’ ‘Italian’ or ‘Netherlandic’ artistic styles. And these ideas affect the investigation of evolutionary and revolutionary changes in European culture: art, fashion, music, language, religion, etc. These changes are often identified with the ‘adult,’ ‘masculine’ and ‘muscular’ activities of Renaissance artists, explorers, politicians and kings.² To consider African children may seem a distraction, when the hegemony of the Renaissance was patronised by western elites: the Borgia, Della Rovere, Habsburg and Medici families. This can lead to a historical determinism that is both emotional and

¹ This paper deliberately posits the Renaissance within a wide historical period that includes: the first part of the early modern period 1485–1660, the Early Renaissance 1450–1528, the High Renaissance 1495–1520 and the Late Renaissance 1520–1600.

² For more on this see ONYEKA, ‘Understanding Diversity in Tudor Music,’ *Modern History Review* 25, no. 3 (February 2023): 18–21; ONYEKA, ‘Decoding Early-Modern European Ethnography in the ‘Masque of Blacknesse’,’ *European History Quarterly* 53, no. 1 (January 2023): 32–39.

In Your Face: A Research Collaboratory and a Pedagogical Handbook Mapping Racial and Sexist Visual Stereotypes | Università di Firenze

© 2023 The Authors. This is an open access article published by In Your Face UniFi under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Licence, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

reductionist—when art narrows our perceptions of the past. In this milieu, the African children pictured in Renaissance art can be interpreted as nameless, servile playthings of the rich and famous. And yet this narrative does not fully explain why African children feature in the pictography of Dutch, English, Flemish, French and Venetian artists. African children are prominent in Paris Bordon's *Portrait of a Man in Armour with Two Pages*,³ Anton Domenico Gabbiani's *Three Musicians of the Medici Court*⁴ and Bartolomé Estéban Murillo's *Three Boys*.⁵ African children also feature in the work of popular European artists such as Hieronymus Bosch,⁶ Hans Memling, Pierre Mignard, Johannes Mijtens and Anthony Van Dyck.⁷ These artists paint street scenes of Europe's hoi polloi, stoical portraits of the powerful, classical reflections of the nativity and Daliesque depictions of heaven and hell, and yet African children remain a persistent presence in their work. This presence is difficult to dismiss as a mere speculative Renaissance fantasy. These children are not fabulous mythical beasts—they are not unicorns.⁸

A few pioneering authors have commented on the presence of African children in Renaissance art. These historians include Thomas Earle, Imtiaz Habib, Kim Hall, Kate Lowe, Debra Higgs Strickland and Gustav Ungerer.⁹ They excavate this pictography within a wider exploration of diversity and ethnography in early modern Europe. They often decode colonial constructs using post-colonial methodologies which include reading in the margins, exploring history from down below and recovering the voice of the 'dumb subaltern.'¹⁰ The latter phrase was coined by Italian philosopher Antonio Gramsci and

³ PARIS BORDON, *Portrait of a Man in Armour (Knight of St John (perhaps Charles V) with Two Pages*, Venice, ca. 1543, oil on canvas, 116.8 x 157.5 cm, Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, <https://www.metmuseum.org/art/collection/search/435722>, accessed on August 8, 2022.

⁴ ANTON DOMENICO GABBIANI, *Italian Portrait of Three Musicians of the Medici Court ... [Young African Man]*, 1687, oil on canvas, 141 x 208, Galleria dell'Accademia, Florence, <https://www.wga.hu/support/viewer/z.html>, accessed July 12, 2023.

⁵ BARTOLOMÉ ESTÉBAN MURILLO, *Three Boys*, c. 1670, oil on canvas, 168.3 x 109.8 cm, Dulwich Picture Gallery, London, <https://www.dulwichpicturegallery.org.uk/explore-the-collection/201-250/three-boys/>, accessed June 8, 2023.

⁶ HIERONYMUS BOSCH, *The Epiphany or the Adoration of the Magi*, 1510, grisaille and oil on oak panel, 147.4 x 168.6 cm, Museo del Prado, Madrid, <https://www.museodelprado.es/en/the-collection/art-work/triptych-of-the-adoration-of-the-magi/666788cc-c522-421b-83f0-5ad84b9377f7>, accessed July 11, 2023.

⁷ JOHANNES MITJENS, *Portrait of Margaretha Van Raaphorst and Young Black Servant*, 1668, oil on canvas, 135 x 105, Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam, <https://www.rijksmuseum.nl/en/collection/SK-A-285>, accessed July 11, 2023.

⁸ The author was one once told by a respected British academic that the inclusion of Africans in Renaissance pictography was for the same reasons that unicorns are depicted.

⁹ This is not an exhaustive list. For more authors, readers may wish to examine the bibliographies in: JEAN VERCOUTTER, DAVID BINDMAN, JEAN DEVISSE, HENRY GATES, and MICHEL MOLLAT, eds, *The Image of the Black in Western Art*, 5 vols., vol. 2 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1976–1979), 101, 113, 136, 140–41, 164, 179, 183, 214, 248–49; and VINCENT BOELE, ERNEST SCHREUDER, and ELMER KOLFIN, eds, *Black is Beautiful: Rubens to Dumas* (Amsterdam: Die Nieuwe Kerk, 2008).

¹⁰ For more on these methodologies, please see EDWARD P. THOMPSON, 'History from Below,' *Times Literary Supplement*, 7 April 1966, 279–80; LUCIEN FEBVRE, 'History Seen From Below and Not Above,' (1932), in FEBVRE, *A New Kind of History: From the Writings of Febvre*, ed. PETER BURKE, trans. K. FOLCA (New York:

adopted by Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak who used it with aplomb in South Asian studies.¹¹ This approach can provide a voice and historical footprint for those seen only as ‘dumb,’ ‘[un]likely,’ ‘unfortunate’ ‘interlopers’ in Europe’s story;¹² or as Kim Hall states, when the subject is ‘too accidental and solitary to be given a historical statistic.’¹³ It is evident that despite these methodologies’ intention, to liberate the African image from the indifference of Eurocentricity, they can create their own restrictive norms. This norm suggests that in early modern Europe all Africans, whether children or adults, were automatically ‘the other,’ ‘strangers,’¹⁴ chattels or ‘by-products’ of European colonialism. In other words, African children had to be devoid of agency, because African adults were.

Therefore, in recontextualising this history, it is necessary to reconsider and sometimes set aside the established historiography on the status of African children and adults. Some historians that attempt to do this include David Bindman, Adrienne Childs, Henry Louis Gates, Miranda Kaufmann, Kate Lowe, Jan Marsh, David Northup, Olivette Otele, J. A. Rogers, Ivan Van Sertima, Marika Sherwood and Jean Vercoutter.¹⁵ These authors focus on different topics and themes, but all use revisionism as a methodology to counter the established narratives mentioned above. Nevertheless, few studies have specifically examined African children and their representation in Renaissance art.

Harper and Row, 1973), 27–45; STEPHEN MILNER, ed., *Steven Epstein. At the Margins: Minority Groups in Premodern Italy* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005).

¹¹ The idea of the ‘dumb subaltern’ is a widely discussed issue in GAYATRI CHAKRAVORTY SPIVAK, ‘Can the Subaltern Speak?’ in *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture*, eds CARY NELSON and LAWRENCE GROSSBERG (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1988), 271–313.

¹² NABIL MATAR, *Islam in Britain, 1558–1685* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1998), 2 and MATAR, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen in the Age of Discovery* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2000); DANIEL VIITKUS, *Turning Turk: English Theatre and the Multicultural Mediterranean, 1570–1630* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003), 21–50; IMTIAZ HABIB, *Shakespeare and Race: Postcolonial Praxis in the Early Modern Period* (Lanham: University Press of America, 1999), 157–205; and VIRGINIA MASON VAUGHAN, *Performing Blackness on English Stages, 1500–1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 57–60.

¹³ KENNETH LITTLE, *Negroes in Britain* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1947), 6, 166 (quotation), 187–216; HABIB, *Black Lives in the English Archives, 1500–1677. Imprints of the Invisible* (Ashgate: London, 2008), 1, quotes KIM HALL, *Things of Darkness: Economies of Race and Gender in Early Modern England*, 2nd ed. (New York: Cornell University Press, 1996), 13. Similar ideas can be found in PETER FRYER, *Staying Power. The History of Black People in Britain Since 1504*, repr. (1984; London: Pluto Press, 1989), 4, 5, 8; JAMES WALVIN, *Black and White. The Negro and English Society 1555–1945* (London: Allen Lane, 1973), 1–16, 16–31; FOLARIN SHYLLON, *Black People in Britain 1553–1833* (London: Oxford University Press, 1977), 1–10; and PAUL EDWARDS and JAMES WALVIN, ‘Africans in Britain, 1500–1800,’ in *The African Diaspora: Interpretive Essays*, eds MARTIN L. KILSON and ROBERT I. ROTBERG (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1976), 172–204.

¹⁴ On the use of the term ‘stranger’, see JOHN STOW, *A Summarie of the Chronicles of England. Diligently Collected, Abridged, and Continued unto this recent yere of Christ, 1598* (London: Richard Bradocke, 1598), 768–69; JESSICA BROWNER, ‘The Wrong Side of the River: London’s Disreputable Southbank in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Century,’ *Essays in History* 36 (1994): 34–72; SUSAN STYLES, *The Poor Law* (London: Macmillan Education, 1985), unpaginated preface.

¹⁵ This is by no means a definitive list. Some of the works by these authors are included in the bibliography.

The study of Renaissance art can challenge the established narratives on African children. In Paris Bordon's *Portrait of a Man in Armour with Two Pages*,¹⁶ the central figure is a knight who is being dressed in his armour by two young boys. One of these young men is situated under the knight's right armpit, fastening the leather straps on the man's pauldron or rerebrace.¹⁷ This page is of European descent. The second page is on the knight's left, carrying the knight's burgonet (helmet). This young man is of African descent. Both pages are dressed in the style of sixteenth-century squires. But the African youth's attire seems particularly resplendent. He is wearing a black doublet and his sleeves are ostentatiously decorated with stripes of gold. During the Renaissance these colours were associated with refinement and power¹⁸ and black clothing had a particular chromatic significance. In many parts of Europe, commoners were prevented by custom, law or convention from wearing colours such as black, gold or purple. These colours were associated with the affluent, famous and influential.¹⁹ The overall meaning of this painting is open to interpretation, but it has been suggested that the knight is Charles V. Therefore, his positioning between two pages is an allegorical metaphor for Spain's power in Europe and Africa, with the pages symbolising each continent respectively. What is certain is that this picture does not automatically 'other' the African. The young African man is not subservient, he stands confidently, perhaps defiantly, with his left hand on his hip and he addresses 'us,' the viewer, directly. This painting offers an invitation to learn more about him and other African children in the Renaissance.

A young African boy is pictured in another painting, by Anton Domenico Gabbiani and entitled *Three Musicians of the Medici Court*.²⁰ The title of the painting does not seem to include the youth, which could be because of his lowly status. But it is uncertain whether this title is contemporaneous or retrospective. And it is known that eighteenth- and nineteenth-century collectors often changed the names, titles and descriptions of early modern artwork, so that ethnic ambiguities regarding status were erased in favour of the certainty of the science of race.²¹ The African child appears with a parrot perched on his

¹⁶ BORDON, *Portrait of a Man in Armour*.

¹⁷ A pauldron or rerebrace is a portion of armour worn over a knight's shoulder.

¹⁸ See PAULA HOHTI, 'When Black Became the Colour of Fashion,' *Refashioning the Renaissance*, <https://refashioningrenaissance.eu/when-black-became-the-colour-of-fashion>, accessed May 15, 2023; MICHEL PASTOREAU, *Black. The History of a Colour* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2008).

¹⁹ Of course, the servants of their liveries may have been permitted to wear these colours. See FRÉDÉRIC DE PORTAL, *An Essay on Symbolic Colours—In Antiquity—The Middle Ages—And Modern Times*, trans. W.S. INMAN (London: John Weale, 1845), i–iii, 9, 7, 10, 12, 20–3, 26–27, 30.

²⁰ GABBIANI, *Italian Portrait of Three Musicians of the Medici Court*.

²¹ On this see JEAN-JACQUES BOUTAUD, *Application des recherches en iconographie publicitaire à la pédagogie de l'expression en I.U.T* (Lille: ANRT, 1989); ELOISE DONNELLY, 'Collecting Renaissance Decorative Art in Britain 1850-1914' (PhD diss., University of Cambridge, 2021); on the science of race, see ONYEKA, *Blackamoors. Africans in Tudor England Their Presence, Status and Origins* (London: Narrative Eye, 2013), xii–xxxv; ONYEKA, *England's Other Countrymen. Black Tudor Society* (London: Bloomsbury, 2023), 1–8.

arm. Parrots of course are not native to Europe.²² And in the early modern period they engendered a sense of the exotic. The proximity of the young African man and the bird may lead us to consider both as foreign and strange. These birds were usually brought from their native countries with a trainer or handler—and this may be the young African’s occupation.²³ This painting can be seen in a wider context. Africans are often depicted as part of the same noble families mentioned earlier. In this case, the boy is employed within the Medici court. And since these families helped sponsor the Renaissance, it is not too specious to argue that these children were connected to the changes in Europe during this period. African children are included amongst the ranks of actors, dignitaries, musicians, pages and servants of nobility across Europe, from the Spanish court of Charles V to the Russian household of Peter the Great. In the latter household, the ‘Moor of Peter the Great,’ Ibrahim Petrovich Gannibal, was a boy ‘gifted’ to him.²⁴ It is worth remembering that in early modern Europe these children often grew up to be integral parts of the powerful families they were sent to serve. For example, the Duke of Florence Alessandro de’ Medici was the son of Simonetta da Colvecchio, a young African servant within the Medici household born in Colvecchio (Sabina, modern Italy). Her ethnicity is a constant feature in Renaissance texts. And the ethnicity of her son, Alessandro, both as a boy and a man, is indicated using the same sobriquet as his mother—‘Il Moro.’²⁵ Another significant issue regarding ethnicity in this family concerns Alessandro’s daughter Giulia de’ Medici. As a girl, she was painted by the Florentine artist Jacopo Carucci (Pontormo).²⁶ Giulia was the granddaughter of Simonetta and retained the family’s African heritage.²⁷ This ethnic visibility may have also influenced the decision of an unknown artist to try and

²² ALMUDENA PÉREZ DE TUDELA and ANNEMARIE JORDAN GSCHWEND, ‘Renaissance Menageries. Exotic Animals and Pets at the Habsburg Courts in Iberia and Central Europe,’ in *Early Modern Zoology: The Construction of Animals in Science, Literature and the Visual Arts*, eds KARL A.E. ENENKEL and MARK S. SMITH, 2 vols., vol. 1 (Leiden: Brill, 2007), 427–55.

²³ *Oxford English Dictionary*, OED online (March 2023), s.v. ‘pouldron,’ <https://www.oed.com/view/Entry/148986;jsessionid=E47646D4AB65F7DB14EDED2F6103272E?redirectedFrom=pouldron>, accessed June 6, 2023.

²⁴ DIEUDONNÉ GNAMMANKOU, *Abraham Hanibal: L’aïeul noir de Pouchkine* (Paris: Présence Africaine, 1996); HUGH BARNES, *Abraham Hanibal Prince of Logone, Pushkin’s African Ancestor* (London: Books of Africa, 2015); HUGH BARNES, *Gannibal: The Moor of Petersburg* (London: Profile Books, 2006); FRANCES MARY SOMERS COCKS, *Moor of St Petersburg: In the Footsteps of a Black Russian* (London: Goldhawk Press, 2005).

²⁵ See CATHERINE FLETCHER, *The Black Prince of Florence. The Spectacular Life and Treacherous World of Alessandro de’ Medici* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016), 14–18; JOHN K. BRACKETT, *Race and Rulership: Alessandro de’ Medici, First Medici Duke of Florence, 1529-1537*, in *Black Africans in Renaissance Europe*, eds THOMAS F. EARLE and KATE J. P. LOWE, 303–325 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005).

²⁶ JACOPO CARUCCI, *Portrait of Maria Salviati de Medici with Giulia de Medici*, ca. 1539, oil on panel, 88 x 71.3 x 1 cm, Walters Art Gallery Museum, Baltimore, <https://art.thewalters.org/detail/26104/portrait-of-maria-salviati-de-medici-with-giulia-de-medici/>, accessed June 10, 2023.

²⁷ CARUCCI, *Portrait of Maria Salviati*.

erase her,²⁸ while a later painting of Giulia as an adult woman is significant in retaining this visibility.²⁹

The notions of visibility discussed above are strongly present in the work of Spanish painter Bartolomé Estéban Murillo's *Three Boys*. During the nineteenth century this painting was erroneously entitled *The Poor Black Boy*.³⁰ However, the painting does not differentiate or delineate the young man in that way. All three boys seem of a similar status and their attire confirms a lowly, but not destitute position. There has been conjecture that the young African may be the son of an enslaved woman Juana de Santiago whom Murillo freed in 1676.³¹ And that the two sitting white boys were Murillo's own sons Gabriel and Gaspar. The painting's meaning is not certain. However, what seems evident is that the African child is the central character. He is standing in the centre of the scene and the action revolves around him. His hand is outstretched, probably for the pie that the seated boy is holding. He is not begging and indeed may be having his pocket picked by the other seated child. The image is powerful, not for what is included, but for what is absent. There is an absence of the automatic inscription of inferiority, enslavement or servility.

Childhood is a socially constructed idea. During the Renaissance childhood was depicted through the lens of the early modern European cultures that shaped it. African children were part of that process and that is why they are depicted in Renaissance art. Hitherto it had been thought that because of their 'blackness' all these children must have been bound to a status of ignobility. But the images discussed above provide an indication that more scholarship is needed on this subject. These images are diverse, but certainly do not confirm the established historiographical narrative. Certainly, these images should not be hived off into a salmagundi of racialised representations of the eighteenth, nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. Too often in these cartoons, paintings, photos and prints, etc. African children are 'grinning Pickaninnies,' animated beyond reason, hysterically jovial in their naive ignorance, even while suffering abject poverty or bondage. These images were used to sell 'things'—from coffee, to soap, to human beings. Lazy scholarship may assume that this automatic inscription began at the start of the early modern period

²⁸ CARUCCI, *Portrait of Maria Salviati*; DAVID BROWN, *Virtue and Beauty: Leonardo's Ginevra de' Benci and Renaissance Portraits of Women* (Washington: National Gallery of Art, 2001), 222; GABRIELLE LANGDON, 'Pontormo and Medici Lineages: Maria Salviati, Alessandro, Giulia and Giulio de' Medici,' *RACAR: Revue d'art Canadienne/ Canadian Art Review* 19, no. 1 (1992): 20–40.

²⁹ ALESSANDRO ALLORI, *Portrait of Giulia de' Medici*, 1559, oil on panel, 121 x 96 cm, Uffizi Galleries, Florence; some scholarly interpretations have interpreted the painting differently and cast doubt on whether it is Giulia, it is now sometimes referred to accordingly as *Portrait of Ortensia de Bardi di Montauto, formerly identified as Giulia de' Medici*. This reconfiguring may be for non-historical reasons. Nevertheless, it is a subject worthy of further inquiry.

³⁰ Commentary in MURILLO, *Three Boys*.

³¹ MURILLO, *Three Boys*.

and continued thereon uninterrupted. It is time to move away from this kind of academic lethargy.

Bibliography and Further Reading

ALBERTI, LEON BATTISTA. *The Family in Renaissance Florence. I Libri della famiglia*. Translated by RENÉE NEU WATKINS. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1969.

BARNES, HUGH. *Abraham Hanibal Prince of Logone, Pushkin's African Ancestor*. London: Books of Africa, 2015.

BARNES, HUGH. *Gannibal: The Moor of Petersburg*. London: Profile Books, 2006.

BARTELS, EMILY CARROLL. *Speaking of the Moor: From Alcazar to Othello*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008.

———. 'Making More of the Moor: Aaron, Othello and Renaissance Refashionings of Race.' *Shakespeare Quarterly* 41, no. 4 (Winter 1990): 433–54. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2870775>

BARTHELEMY, ANTHONY GERARD. *Black Face, Maligned Race: The Representation of Blacks in English Drama from Shakespeare to Southerne*. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1987.

BOELE, VINCENT, ERNEST SCHREUDER, and ELMER KOLFIN, eds. *Black is Beautiful: Rubens to Dumas*. Amsterdam: Die Nieuwe Kerk, 2008.

BOUTAUD, JEAN-JACQUES. *Application des recherches en iconographie publicitaire à la pédagogie de l'expression en I.U.T.* Lille: ANRT, 1989.

BRACKETT, JOHN K. *Race and Rulership: Alessandro de' Medici, First Medici Duke of Florence, 1529-1537*, in *Black Africans in Renaissance Europe*, edited by THOMAS F. EARLE and KATE J. P. LOWE, 303–325. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

BROWN, DAVID. *Virtue and Beauty: Leonardo's Ginevra de' Benci and Renaissance Portraits of Women*. Washington: National Gallery of Art, 2001.

BROWNER, JESSICA. 'The Wrong Side of the River: London's Disreputable Southbank in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Century.' *Essays in History* 36 (1994): 34–72. <https://doi.org/10.25894/cih.485>

BUSS, CHIARA. 'A Very Fine Black Color.' In *Silk, Gold, Crimson: Secrets and Technology at the Visconti and Sforza Courts*, edited by CHIARA BUSS and ANNALISA ZANNI, n.p. Milan: Silvana Editoriale, 2009.

COLLIER, MALCOLM. 'Approaches to Analysis in Visual Anthropology.' *Handbook of Visual Analysis*, edited by THEO VAN LEEUWEN and CAREY JEWITT. Los Angeles: Sage, 2010.

ONYEKA NUBIA

COONIN, ARNOLD VICTOR. 'Portrait Busts of Children in Quattrocento Florence.' *Metropolitan Museum of Art Bulletin* 30 (1995): 61–71. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1512950>

CRAWFORD, PATRICIA. *Blood, Bodies and Families in Early Modern England*. Harlow: Longman, 2004.

——— *Parents of Poor Children in England 1580–1800*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010.

——— *Women and Religion in England 1500–1720*. London: Routledge, 1993.

CRAWFORD, PATRICIA and MARGARET ANDERSON, eds. *Exploring Women's Past: Essays in Social History*. Carlton: Sisters Publishing, 1983.

CRAWFORD, PATRICIA and SARA HELLER MENDELSON, eds. *Women in Early Modern England 1550–1720*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780198201243.001.0001>

CRAWFORD, PATRICIA and LAURA GOWING, eds. *Women's World's in Seventeenth-Century England*. London: Routledge, 2000.

CRESSY, DAVID. *Birth, Marriage, and Death: Ritual, Religion, and the Life-Cycle in Tudor and Stuart England*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780198201687.001.0001>

CUNNINGHAM, HUGH. *Children and Childhood in Western Society since 1500*. Harlow: Pearson, 2005.

CURRIE, ELIZABETH. *Fashion and Masculinity in Renaissance Florence*. London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2016.

DEMAUSE, LLOYD. *The History of Childhood*. New York: The Psychohistory Press, 1974.

DEPAEPE, MATE and BREGT HENKENS. 'The History of Education and the Challenge of the Visual.' *Paedagogica Historica* 36, no. 1 (2000): 10–17. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0030923000360101>

DONNELLY, ELOISE. 'Collecting Renaissance Decorative Art in Britain 1850-1914.' PhD diss., University of Cambridge, 2021.

EARLE, THOMAS F. and KATE J. P. LOWE, eds. *Black Africans in Renaissance Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

EDWARDS, PAUL and JAMES WALVIN. 'Africans in Britain, 1500–1800.' In *The African Diaspora: Interpretive Essays*, edited by MARTIN L. KILSON and ROBERT I. ROTBERG, 172–204. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1976.

ETTLINGER, HELEN S. 'Visibilis et Invisibilis: The Mistress in Italian Renaissance Court Society.' *Renaissance Quarterly* 47, no. 4 (1994): 770–792. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2863216>

FEBVRE, LUCIEN. 'History Seen From Below and Not Above.' (1932) In LUCIEN FEBVRE, *A New Kind of History: From the Writings of Febvre*, edited by PETER BURKE, translated by K. FOLCA, 27–45. New York: Harper and Row, 1973.

FLETCHER, CATHERINE. *The Black Prince of Florence. The Spectacular Life and Treacherous World of Alessandro de' Medici*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016.

FRASER, PETER. 'Slaves or Free People, the Status of Africans in England 1550–1750.' In *From Strangers to Citizens: The Integration of Immigrant Communities in Britain, Ireland, and Colonial America, 1550–1750*, edited by RANDOLPH VIGNE and CHARLES LITTLETON, 254–260. Eastbourne: Sussex Academic Press, 2001.

FRYER, PETER. *Staying Power: The History of Black People in Britain Since 1504*. 1984. Reprint, London: Pluto Press, 1989.

FUCHS, BARBARA. *Exotic Nation: Maurophilia and the Construction of Early Modern Spain*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008.

GNAMMANKOU, DIEUDONNE. *Abraham Hanibal: l'aïeul noir de Pouchkine*. Paris: Présence Africaine, 1996.

HABIB, IMTIAZ. *Black Lives in the English Archives, 1500-1677: Imprints of the Invisible*. London: Routledge, 2008.

———. *Shakespeare and Race: Postcolonial Praxis in the Early Modern Period*. Lanham: University Press of America, 1999.

HALL, KIM. *Things of Darkness: Economies of Race and Gender in Early Modern England*. 1995. Second edition, New York: Cornell University Press, 1996.

———. 'Object into Object, Some Thoughts on the Presence of Black Women in Early Modern Culture.' In *Early Modern Visual Culture: Representation, Race, Empire in Renaissance England*, edited by PETER ERICKSON and CLARKE HULSE, 346–380. Philadelphia: University Press, 2000.

HARVEY, JOHN. *Men in Black*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995.

HENDRICK, HARRY. 'The Child as a Social Actor in Historical Sources – Problems of Identification and Interpretation.' In *Research with Children: Perspectives and Practices*, edited by PIA CHRISTIANSEN and ALLISON JAMES, 36–57. Oxfordshire: Routledge Falmer, 2008.

HEYWOOD, COLIN. *History of Childhood*. Malden: Blackwell Publishers, 2001.

HOHTI, PAULA. 'When Black Became the Colour of Fashion.' *Refashioning the Renaissance*, <https://refashioningrenaissance.eu/when-black-became-the-colour-of-fashion>, accessed May 15, 2023.

KELLY-GADOL, JOAN. 'Did Women Have a Renaissance?' In *Becoming Visible: Women in European History*, edited by RENATE BRIDENTHAL, CLAUDIA KOONZ, and SUSAN STUARD, 175–205. 1977. Second edition, Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1987.

KENT, DALE. *Friendship, Love, and Trust in Renaissance Florence*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2009.

KIRBY, JO, MAARTIN VAN BOMMEL, and ANDRÉ VERHECKEN. *Natural Colorants for Dyeing and Lake Pigments: Practical Recipes and their Historical Sources*. London: Archetype Books, 2014.

ONYEKA NUBIA

LALWAN, RORY, ed. *Sources for Black and Asian History at the City of Westminster Archives Centre*. London: Westminster City Archives, 2005.

LANGDON, GABRIELLE. 'Pontormo and Medici Lineages: Maria Salviati, Alessandro, Giulia and Giulio de' Medici,' *RACAR: Revue d'art Canadienne/ Canadian Art Review* 19, no. 1 (1992): 20–40. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1072850ar>

LITTLE, KENNETH. *Negroes in Britain*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1947.

MASON VAUGHAN, VIRGINIA. *Performing Blackness on English Stages, 1500–1800*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

MATAR, NABIL. *Islam in Britain, 1558–1685*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1998.

——— *Turks, Moors and Englishmen in the Age of Discovery*. 1999. New edition, New York: Columbia University Press, 2000.

MATAR, NABIL, ed. *In the Lands of the Christians: Arabic Travel Writing in the Seventeenth Century*. New York: Routledge, 2002.

MILNER, STEPHEN, ed. *Steven Epstein. At the Margins: Minority Groups in Premodern Italy*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005

MUNRO, JOHN H. 'The Anti-Red Shift – To the Dark Side: Color Changes in Flemish Luxury Woolens, 1300-1550.' In *Medieval Clothing and Textiles*, 16 vols., vol. 3, edited by ROBIN NETHERTON and GALE R. OWEN-CROCKER, 55–96. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2007.

MUSACCHIO, JACQUELINE MARIE. *Art, Marriage, and Family in the Florentine Renaissance Palace*. Yale: Yale University Press, 2008.

ONYEKA NUBIA. 'The Missing Tudors, Black People in Sixteenth-Century England.' *BBC History Magazine* 13, no. 7 (July 2012): 32–33.

——— 'What's in a Name?' *History Today* 62, no. 10 (October 2012): 34–39.

——— *Blackamoors: Africans in Tudor England. Their Presence, Status and Origins*. London: Narrative Eye, 2013.

——— *England's Other Countrymen: Black Tudor Society*. London: ZED Books, 2019.

——— 'Decoding Early Modern European Ethnography in the Masque of Blackness.' *European History Quarterly* 53, no. 1 (January 2023): 32–39. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0265691422114366>.

——— 'Understanding Diversity in Tudor Music.' *Modern History Review* 25, no. 3 (February 2023): 18–21.

ORTEGA-SAEZ, NATALIA. 'Black Dyed Wool in North Western Europe, 1680–1850: The Relationship between Historical Recipes and the Current State of Preservation.' Unpublished PhD diss., University of Antwerp, 2018.

- PASTOREAU, MICHEL. *Black: The History of a Colour*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2008.
- PEREZ DE TUDELA, ALMUDENA and ANNEMARIE JORDAN GSCHWEND, 'Renaissance Menageries. Exotic Animals and Pets at the Habsburg Courts in Iberia and Central Europe.' In *Early Modern Zoology: The Construction of Animals in Science, Literature and the Visual Arts*, edited by KARL A.E. ENENKEL and MARK S. SMITH, 2 vols., vol. 1, 427–55. Leiden: Brill, 2007.
- PORTAL, FRÉDÉRIC DE. *An Essay on Symbolic Colours—In Antiquity—The Middle Ages—And Modern Times*. Translated by W.S. INMAN. London: John Weale, 1845.
- RUBLAK, ULINKA. 'Renaissance Dress, Cultures of Making, and the Period Eye.' *Journal of Decorative Arts, Design History, and Material Culture* 23, no. 1 (Spring-Summer 2016): 6–34. <https://doi.org/10.1086/688198>
- SCOBIE, EDWARD. 'The African Presence in Early Europe.' In *Journal of African Civilizations* 7, no. 2 (1985): 190–203.
- SCOBIE, EDWARD. 'The Moors and Portugal's Global Expansion.' In *Golden Age of the Moor. Journal of African Civilizations 11 (Fall 1991)*, edited by IVAN VAN SERTIMA, 331–359. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 1993.
- SHERWOOD, MARIKA. 'Blacks in Elizabethan England.' *History Today* 53, no. 10 (2003): 40–2.
- SHYLLON, FOLARIN. *Black People in Britain 1553-1833*. London: Oxford University Press, 1977.
- SOMERS COCKS, FRANCES MARY. *Moor of St Petersburg: In the Footsteps of a Black Russian*. London: Goldhawk Press, 2005
- SPIVAK, GAYATRI CHAKRAVORTY. 'Can the Subaltern Speak?' In *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture*, edited by CARY NELSON and LAWRENCE GROSSBERG, 271–313. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1988.
- STOW, JOHN. *A Summarie of the Chronicles of England. Diligently Collected, Abridged, and Continued unto this recent yere of Christ, 1598*. London: Richard Bradocke, 1598.
- STREHLKE, CARL BRANDON. *Pontormo, Bronzino and the Medici: The Transformation of the Renaissance Portrait in Florence*. Philadelphia: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2004.
- STYLES, SUSAN. *The Poor Law*. London: Macmillan Education, 1985.
- SUJATA, IYENGAR. *Shades of Difference: Mythologies of Skin Colour in Early Modern England*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008. <https://doi.org/10.9783/9780812202335>
- THOMPSON, EDWARD P. 'History from Below,' *Times Literary Supplement*, 7 April 1966, 279–80.
- UNGERER, GUSTAV. *The Mediterranean Apprenticeship of British Slavery*. Madrid: Verbum Editorial, 2008.
- VERCOUTTER, DAVID BINDMAN, JEAN DEVISSE, HENRY GATES, and MICHEL MOLLAT, eds. *The Image of the Black in Western Art*, 5 vols., vol. 2. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1976–1979.

ONYEKA NUBIA

VITKUS, DANIEL. *Turning Turk: English Theatre and the Multicultural Mediterranean, 1570–1630*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003.

WALVIN, JAMES. *Black and White. The Negro and English Society 1555-1945*. London: Allen Lane, 1973.